

January 18, 2005

Ms. Theresa Lock Sergeant, Support Services Williamson County Sheriff's Office 508 South Rock Street Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2005-00541

Dear Sergeant Lock:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 217020.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified incident, excluding autopsy reports. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101,552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We begin by noting that some of the submitted information is not responsive to the instant request for information.¹ We have marked this information, which the sheriff need not release in response to this request and this ruling will not address that information.

We next note that the remaining submitted information is subject to required public disclosure under section 552.022 of the Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

¹We note that the requestor specifically excluded autopsy reports from the request.

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The information at issue consists of a completed investigation. Therefore, as prescribed by section 552.022, the sheriff must release such information unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 or expressly confidential under other law. Section 552.103 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and is therefore not other law that makes information expressly confidential for purposes of section 552.022(a). See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News, 4 S.W.3d 469 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103). Therefore, the information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.103.

You assert that the submitted information is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which states in pertinent part:

- (a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [is excepted from required public disclosure] if:
 - (4) it is information that:
 - (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or
 - (B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4). However, you do not assert that the information at issue was prepared by an attorney representing the state or that it reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state. See Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4). Thus, you may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108.

Section 552.101 excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. You claim that the submitted information contains medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 provides in pertinent part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter. (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). The MPA governs access to medical records. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The MPA requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which a governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Moreover, information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* Occ. Code § 159.002(a), (b), (c); Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Based on our review of the submitted information however, we find that the responsive documents do not constitute or reflect a "record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician" and thus are not medical records subject to the MPA.

We note that the submitted documents contain social security numbers. A social security number is confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act if it was obtained or is maintained by the sheriff under any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. See 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I); Open Records Decision No. 622 at 2-4 (1994). It is not apparent to this office that the social security numbers contained in the submitted information are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I) of the federal law. You have cited no law, and we are aware of no law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990 that requires or authorizes the sheriff to obtain or maintain a social security number. We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers in the responsive information are confidential section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Act on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.007, .352. Therefore, before releasing a social security number, the sheriff should ensure that it was not obtained and is not maintained by the sheriff under any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right to privacy. Information must be withheld from the public under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy when the information is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) of no legitimate public interest. See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd., 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in Industrial Foundation included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683.

This office has concluded that other types of information also are private under section 552.101. See Open Records Decision Nos. 659 at 4-5 (1999) (summarizing information attorney general has held to be private), 470 at 4 (1987) (illness from severe

emotional job-related stress), 455 at 9 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), 343 at 1-2 (1982) (references in emergency medical records to drug overdose, acute alcohol intoxication, obstetrical/gynecological illness, convulsions/seizures, or emotional/mental distress). We have marked private information that the sheriff must withhold under section 552.101.

Finally, we note that section 552.130 of the Government Code is applicable to some of the submitted information. Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information that relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Thus, the sheriff must withhold Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information under section 552.130. We note that if the sheriff lacks the technical capability to redact motor vehicle information from the video tape, the sheriff must withhold the portions of the video tape containing motor vehicle information in their entirety. See Open Records Decision No. 364 (1983).

In summary: (1) social security numbers may be confidential under federal law; (2) we have marked the information that the sheriff must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information must be withheld under section 552.130; and (4) the remaining responsive information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public

records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Cindy Nettles

Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

CN/krl

Ref:

ID# 217020

Enc.

Submitted documents

c:

Mr. Neal Davis
DeGuerin Dickson & Hennessy
1018 Preston Avenue, 7th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002
(w/o enclosures)